

Appendix 1

Parking Payment Options

1) Ensuring that Chichester District parking payment options remain attractive to customers and customers are encouraged to use them.

At a national level, pay and display methods using cash are still the most common parking payment method. However, cashless and contactless payment methods are now becoming more widespread. Customers want to be able to pay for services as seamlessly as possible, using new technologies where appropriate. Customers expect a quick and effortless service, and one way of doing this is to have an online parking account where drivers are able to manage their details and automatically pay for a service as they use it.

However, many customers remain keen to use cash – this is partly due to it being perceived as ‘easier’ and more reliable. People are sometimes reluctant to set up a new payment account because this is unfamiliar. Any changes to parking payment methods must consider the customer base and demographics – i.e. an ‘evolution’ in parking payments rather than a ‘revolution’ – rolling out new payment options but retaining cash or other payment methods as an option to ensure good customer service for all.

1(a) Payment by Coins

Where coins are accepted there is the need to securely collect and process the income at a cost to the authority. There is also the risk of break-ins to payment machines with a potential loss of income. Reducing the amount of coins coming through the authority will decrease the cost of processing this income and loss from theft. Whilst the number of parking payment machines can be considered to determine whether a reduction can be made to generate a revenue saving on maintenance, unless the actual proportion of coins coming through the system is reduced there will not be a saving on the collection and processing costs. The new £1 coin which will be introduced in 2017 will require the existing machines to have an upgrade.

1(b) Payment by Credit / Debit card

Contactless card payments, unlike contact chip or chip and pin transactions, are designed to occur offline – i.e. the terminal doesn’t connect to the bank. This speeds up the transaction significantly. From January 2016 all card-payment machines being deployed within the parking industry must include contactless functionality. This will further reduce the cost and hardware support as well as potentially reduce transaction charges.

Work is currently being undertaken to replace some of the older Pay and Display machines with new machines – for which a large proportion will be capable of taking debit card payments. The recent survey of car park users has revealed that the popularity of paying with coins has decreased since 2012 when the previous survey was undertaken. This survey also revealed that customers would like to see more debit / credit card payment options within car parks and the introduction of payment by mobile phone (including apps – see 1(c) below).

1(c) Payment by Mobile Phones / Apps

Many people now manage their lives via their smartphones, so it is inevitable that mobile cashless parking is attractive. Parking using a cashless system is seen as quicker and more convenient by many customers, who do not have to stand in all weathers using a parking payment machine and can top up remotely if they stay longer than they had estimated when they first paid. 'RingGo', the largest provider of phone parking in the country, processed a record 2.5m parking sessions in September 2015, a rise of 150% on January 2014. Motorists paid a total of £12.4m to leave their vehicles at one of the 700,000 spaces where 'RingGo' is available.

Initial discussions have been held with companies who are able to provide a payment by phone method of parking. The first time a customer uses the service they call the telephone number displayed on the car park signs (a local rate number), provide their car details & credit/debit card information, a location number and how long they want to park for. The customer's credit/debit card is billed immediately and the funds sent directly to the Councils merchant account. Whenever the customer wishes to use the service again the system recognises their mobile telephone number and asks them to confirm the registration of the car they are parking (or lets them specify a different one) and the location code of the car park plus how long they wish to park, this call normally takes no longer than 30 seconds.

Customers can choose whether to receive a text reminder when their pre-paid parking is about to expire (at a cost of 10p) and they can extend their stay by making an additional call if they wish (assuming the particular car park terms and conditions allow it). Each call costs 20p which is described as a "convenience fee" and this is retained by the supplying company, with the parking fees being paid to the Council. Whilst there is a fee attached to this for the customer it is considered that customers are prepared to pay this for the convenience of the service.

Enforcement of the pay by phone service by Civil Enforcement Officers (CEO) is undertaken via a special application loaded on to a standard mobile phone, smartphone or integrated handheld device enabling the CEO to access details of all parking sessions in real-time. There may be an initial cost to the authority to provide the equipment to CEO should their existing devices not support the system.

The system can be accessed via an internet page so it is accessible from anywhere by anyone with a valid userid and password. Customers can view their accounts, print off receipts and change their personal details and preferences, with staff having access to a web-based back office system where all of the parking transactions can be viewed in real time or historically.

Introducing a payment by phone / app method of parking within the district would result in a reduction in the cost associated with coin payment collections and would also provide another method of payment for the customer, which could potentially result in an increased level of income. In addition, research consistently demonstrates that drivers are more likely to be compliant with parking regulations if

payment methods are made as easy as possible, which could result in a reduction in the amount of Penalty Charge Notices (PCN) being issued. The most quoted reason for taking a risk with not paying for parking is the lack of sufficient loose change.

It is also believed customers are more likely to purchase time not limited by available cash in their pockets, and therefore tend to purchase an over-estimated amount of parking time. A payment by phone / app method of parking will also eliminate the transfer of tickets from one vehicle to another which would assist with responding to challenges to PCNs and may also increase income. Payment by phone / app parking also provides a clear audit trail linking the purchase of a ticket to a particular registration.

Pay and Display machines inevitably suffer downtime due to coin jams, petty machine vandalism and coin box attacks. Where a payment by phone / method is introduced the customer can park without the need to use the machine. The Parking Forum are also very supportive of payment methods by phone.

1(d) Cashless parking

The parking industry has developed over recent years to include a number of other systems which provide parking using a 'cashless' system where the customer registers a parking activity using an online system and the car park is monitored by automatic number plate recognition (ANPR) cameras to track usage of the car park. These methods of parking payment are being actively considered by this authority. However, the Government has legislated against enforcement by CCTV cameras in some cases and it would mean moving away from the Traffic Management Act 2004 to operate.

This is therefore not recommended at this stage and instead a watching brief is suggested to determine whether there may be other methods of payment to implement at a later stage.

2 Pay On Foot – Review

The Pay on Foot system of parking was introduced to the Avenue de Chartres car park in January 2015 and has meant that approximately 23% of all car parking spaces owned and managed by Chichester District Council in the city are now Pay on Foot - approximately 15% of all spaces across the district. The Avenue de Chartres car park is a gateway car park into the city and the second largest car park (Cattle Market being the largest).

A Pay on Foot system enables users to park and not pay until they wish to leave. This means users do not need to worry about how long they stay and the possibility of receiving a Penalty Charge Notice. It is also suggested that the longer someone stays, the more they are likely to spend in the local economy. One of the other benefits of the new system is that the payment machines can be re-set remotely.

The approved PID for ADC estimated an increase in income as a result of the implementation of the Pay on Foot system of 15% – i.e. approximately £59,000 per annum. An analysis of the usage and income from the Avenue De Chartres car park has been undertaken, since the Pay on Foot system went live. There has been a

small increase in income within the car park since the system was introduced. Income received since the system went live is £410,018, which compares to £386,985 for the same period the previous year - an increase of £23,033. However, the fact that an increase in parking tariffs was introduced during the period and taking account of the cost of the handling calls through the intercom¹ means that no significant increase in income has occurred during the first 12 months of operation. An analysis of the average length of stay also suggests that this has not increased to date. The reason for the lower than expected increase in income may be due to a number of factors: driver behaviour can mean that people over-pay with pay and display; the number of season ticket holders who use the car park along with commuters and some customers prefer other car parks in the city.

The potential for re-allocation of patrolling hours of the CEOs to other areas that require enforcement was as expected, as was the removal of the requirement to replenish tickets in the 15 Pay and Display machines and to empty each machine of cash. This re-allocation of enforcement has occurred, although not initially as there was a noticeable amount of time spent by the CEOs in resolving installation issues. There has also been additional involvement from the administration team within Parking Services to deal with issues through the barrier intercom system, along with involvement of the Careline service to take out of hours calls. The number of calls being received initially was quite high but has now reduced. However, they are still a factor when considering whether a Pay on Foot system should be rolled out further including the impact of an increased workload for staff within Parking Services and Chichester Careline in dealing with these calls.

The Pay on Foot method of parking was new not only to our local residents in the city, but also to staff within Parking Services who have had to consider issues as they arise and deal with these accordingly. This has taken a significant amount of time within the team. A project such as this is not one which can be tested in parallel to another system in place – this must be tested once 'live'. Despite several notices placed within the car park advising customers of how the system operates, there have been a significant number of cases where members of the public have either attempted to pay upon arrival at the car park or who have arrived at the barrier believing that they are able to pay. This again has taken some time for staff to deal with but these types of occurrences have now reduced.

Cabinet agreed that Blue Badge Holders who previously did not pay to park at the ADC car park should pay for parking, as there was no feasible alternative method of providing parking free of charge within the car park once the system had gone live. There have been one or two customers who are not happy with this approach. However overall there would appear to be few issues and there are still a large

¹ The system implemented uses Automatic Number Plate Recognition (ANPR). This scans the vehicle registration and allows access to or exit from the car park. The industry expectation for accuracy of an Automatic Number Plate Recognition system is around 93%. The system in place within the Avenue de Chartres has been operating within or higher than this expected level (96% accurate at times). Given the number of spaces within the car park and the expected usage levels, there will therefore always be a number of vehicles where the system will not pick up the registration effectively. The drivers of these vehicles push the button at the exit of the car park for the barrier to be raised remotely or to provide instant support to customers.

number of free parking spaces designated for Blue Badge holders within the city and the ADC car park is not a popular choice for many Blue Badge holders.

The project itself demonstrated that capital cost is only one consideration as design, reliability and capacity all carry significant risk of loss of revenue and public support through the implementation process.

A survey has been undertaken of customers (which is summarised in Appendix 2). This has revealed that 63% of respondents rated their satisfaction with the pay on foot system at 7 or more out of 10. Popular suggestions for improvement included the introduction of more payment machines, more / better signage to help people find the payment machines and more reliable payment machines and barriers. Around 60% of respondents stated that they found pay on foot parking more convenient and that they generally preferred it. Generally, respondents said that pay on foot had not changed the amount of time they stay in Chichester city. However, 39% of customers who were surveyed in the ADC car park (as opposed to online), and who were not season ticket holders said they stayed longer in Chichester city because of pay on foot.

The Chichester BID was asked for feedback to represent their view and that of local businesses. Feedback suggests that there is concern that the ADC car park was not the most popular car park – as a result of the fact that surface car parks are generally preferred. The view of the BID is that changing the system of payment would not change that dramatically. The BID feel that the latest refurbishment works to the ADC are a great improvement but have stated that they feel that the change to a Pay on Foot system within the car park could have been better advertised, with better signage on the outside of the car park. The BID would also like to see additional signage within the car park and further payment machines. The BID's preference is for Pay on Foot to be installed in all three major car parks in Chichester city and would like incentives to be provided to encourage use of the car parks. Feedback from one restaurant in South Street in Chichester suggests that the number of guests who request to pay their bill quickly as their car park ticket is running out has declined since the Pay on Foot system was introduced. They also stated that their dessert sales have increased by 2%, which may be a coincidence or a direct result of the Pay on Foot system in place.

A Civil Engineer has produced designs of several car parks within Chichester city to consider whether they were suited for the best locations for the potential roll-out of the Pay on Foot system to other car parks.

3. Encouraging customers to use car parks owned and managed by Chichester District Council as they meet their needs and are user-friendly.

3 (a) Safer Parking Award

Car parks within Chichester city are all currently covered by the Park Mark Safer Parking Award, which is administered by the British Parking Association (BPA) and supported by the Home Office and the Association of Chief Police Officers. This accreditation is primarily aimed at the prevention of criminal behaviour within the parking environment, and therefore requires owners / operators to adopt an active management strategy to ensure that there is minimal occurrence of crime. The

existence of this accreditation assists with reducing crime and the fear of crime in car parks and provides assurance to the general public that measures have been introduced to ensure that the parking facility is a safe environment.

Work is currently underway to assess all rural car parks within the district with the ultimate aim that all rural car parks will eventually be covered by the Safer Parking Award. There will be a minimal revenue increase in budget required for this.

3 (b) Customer assistance

Many private car parks provide 'zoned' areas, numbered spaces / rows or sensors to assist customers to find a space. These options tend to be in place only in larger car parks and, whilst providing an easier mechanism for customers to locate their vehicles, do have an initial cost and an on-going revenue cost.

It is recommended that a system of zoning / numbering rows should be considered for the larger car parks in Chichester city.

3 (c) Data and Apps

There is currently no open, centralised database of parking spaces in the UK, although other European countries have implemented one. This is likely to change, and once implemented it will allow a better service to the motorist, along with benefits to parking providers who are able to feed information to a central app. Currently there are a number of car parks in the city which have real-time data on the number of vacant spaces. A link to the data is provided through the council's website.

Future expansion of this service should be considered, as part of the consideration of parking demand within the district. This will be subject to financial consideration and agreement with West Sussex County Council.

3 (d) Virtual Permits

With the introduction of a new ICT system within Parking Services later this year, there will be an opportunity to introduce a virtual permit (season ticket) system within the council's car parks. This could result in a potential cost and time saving, given that permits for car parks are currently printed and sent out to customers. One issue for consideration with virtual permits is that currently the majority of permits in the city's car parks are permitted to cover four vehicles. This would reduce to one vehicle if virtual permits were in place.

It is recommended that this is explored further once the new ICT system is in place.

4. Ensuring the best use of Council assets is maintained through the effective and efficient use of car parks, ensuring maximum potential.

4 (a) The use of car parks by third parties

Parking Services works very closely with both the Public Relations and Estates teams to consider opportunities for advertising, sponsorship, and the use of car parks by third parties for events, etc. Whilst revenue has been achieved through the

use of the ADC multi-storey car park for advertising, planning considerations have meant that advertising opportunities have not been rolled out to surface car parks.

Work to explore whether advertising can be provided within surface car parks should be undertaken.

4 (b) Making optimum use of the existing parking stock

West Sussex County Council has engaged a consultant to review parking spaces within Chichester city. This review is also giving some consideration to the number and location of spaces within council-owned car parks. Further consideration will be given to the number and location of car parks once the results from this study are provided.

In addition, a Civil Engineer was engaged by the District Council during 2015 to provide an assessment of a number of car parks to consider the possibility of introducing additional parking bays. There will be a cost to undertaking this work (in the form of lining works); however, it is considered that this will be paid back by the increased number of parking bays. Little London car park (one of the most popular car parks in the city) has the potential for additional bays and works will be ordered to provide this.

5. Summary of payment and enhancement options

Table 1 below provides detail of consideration of all council-owned car parks and the payment options considered most suitable. Where replacement of machines is suggested this can be undertaken as part of the capital budget using the asset replacement fund. A payment by phone method is likely to have minimal set-up costs as customers will pay the fee for the service upon use. Potential cost to the authority of around £1,000 to upgrade phones.

Table 1: Summary of Payment and enhancement options	
Car Park	Payment Options / Enhancements proposed
Avenue de Chartres, Chichester Currently five machines, Pay on Foot, card, coin, notes payment, season tickets	Pay on Foot already implemented. Virtual permits to be offered. Additional Signage. Further Marketing of car park to encourage use. Zoning of car park.
Northgate, Chichester Currently ten machines, Pay and Display. Coins accepted, cards	Pay on Foot not feasible at this time given the access issues and potential impact on the highway. Re-design of spaces to increase the number of bays in the car park and the number of designated Blue Badge bays. Explore the potential to direct traffic as a one-way flow into and out of the car park, when a Pay on Foot system may be

Table 1: Summary of Payment and enhancement options	
Car Park	Payment Options / Enhancements proposed
accepted in three machines. Season tickets	possible at a later date. A payment by phone / app solution to be introduced, along with additional card payment machines Virtual permits to be offered. Zoning of car park.
Cattle Market, Chichester Currently nine machines, Pay and Display. Coins accepted. Season tickets.	Exploration of Pay on Foot system of parking (estimated capital cost of £170,000 and an estimated net revenue cost of £20,000 per annum). This is subject to consideration of the future of car parks resulting from the outcome of the Roadspace Audit, Chichester Vision and the Place Plan. The experience of Pay on Foot at the ADC suggests that the payback for this project will be a significant period of time. Payment by phone to be introduced. Zoning to be introduced.
Basin Road Currently two machines, Pay and Display. Coin only. Season tickets.	Payment by phone / app and card to be introduced. Virtual permits to be offered.
Westgate Currently five machines, Pay and Display. Coin only.	Currently payment is made by coins. Payment options to be considered alongside the refund process currently in place.
Little London Currently three machines, Pay and Display. Coin accepted, card accepted in one machine.	Payment by phone / app and card to be offered. Re-lining to be undertaken to increase number of bays.
Baffins Lane Currently three machines, coin only.	Payment by phone / app and card to be offered. Potential for consideration of Pay on Foot at a later date.
Orchard Street	Payment by phone / app and card to be introduced.

Table 1: Summary of Payment and enhancement options	
Car Park	Payment Options / Enhancements proposed
Currently two machines, coin only. Season ticket.	Virtual permits to be offered.
St Cyriacs Currently two machines, coin only.	Payment by phone / app and card to be introduced.
South Pallant Currently two machines, coin only.	Payment by phone / app and card to be introduced.
East Pallant / Cawley Priory Currently six machines, coins, and cards accepted in two.	Payment by phone / app and card to be introduced.
Market Avenue / St John's Street Currently two machines, coin only.	Phone / app and card payments to be introduced, along with virtual permits.
Market Road Currently one machine, coin only. Season ticket.	Phone / app and card payments to be introduced, along with virtual permits.
Market Avenue / South Pallant Currently one machine, coin only. Season ticket.	Phone / app and card payments to be introduced. Virtual permits to be offered.
New Park Road Currently three machines, coin only.	Phone / app and card to payments be introduced.
Coach Park Currently one machine, coin only.	Phone / app and card to be offered payments to be introduced.
Grange Road, Midhurst Currently five machines, coin only.	Whilst the design and layout would suit a Pay on Foot system, the next stages of development on the site should be considered before this is undertaken, in addition to the payback period given the tariffs. Phone / app and card,

Table 1: Summary of Payment and enhancement options	
Car Park	Payment Options / Enhancements proposed
Season ticket.	along with virtual permits to be offered.
North Street, Midhurst Currently three machines, coin only. Season ticket.	Phone / app and card payments to be introduced, along with virtual permits to be offered.
Post Office, Midhurst Currently two machines, coin only. Season ticket.	Phone / app, card payments and virtual permits to be introduced.
Pound Street, Petworth Currently five machines, coin only. Season ticket.	Phone / app, card payments and virtual permits to be introduced.
Sylvia Beaufoy, Petworth	Free of charge car park.
Bosham Lane, Bosham Currently three machines, coin accepted. Card facility in two machines.	Phone / app, card payments and virtual permits to be introduced.
Bracklesham Lane, Bracklesham Currently three machines, coin only.	Phone / app, and card payments to be introduced. Designated Blue Badge bays to be introduced.
Crossfield, Fernhurst	Free of charge car park.
East Beach, Selsey Currently four machines, coin only. Season ticket.	Phone / app, card payments and virtual permits to be introduced.
East Street, Selsey Currently two machines, coin only. Season ticket.	Phone / app, card payments and virtual permits to be introduced.
Marine, Selsey Currently two	Phone / app and card payments to be introduced.

Table 1: Summary of Payment and enhancement options	
Car Park	Payment Options / Enhancements proposed
machines, coin only.	
Marine Drive, East Wittering Currently two machines, coin only.	Phone / app, card payments and virtual permits to be introduced.
Northern Crescent, East Wittering Currently two machines, coin only.	Phone / app, card payments and virtual permits to be introduced.